

**MINUTES**  
**ORO VALLEY ART REVIEW COMMISSION**  
**REGULAR SESSION**  
**July 6, 2010**  
**HOPI ROOM**  
**11000 N. LA CAÑADA DRIVE**

Call to Order at or around 4:00 p.m.

Chairman Moutafis called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

**Roll Call**

**PRESENT:** Matthew Moutafis, Chairman  
Zev Cywan, Vice Chair  
Steve Hagedorn, Commissioner  
Gail Munden, Commissioner

**EXCUSED:** Shirley Dornberg, Commissioner

1. [Approval of the June 1, 2010, ARC minutes.](#)

[Draft minutes](#)

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Commissioner Hagedorn and seconded by Commissioner Munden to approve the June 1, 2010, ARC minutes.

**MOTION** carried, 4-0.

2. [OV510-005, The Town of Oro Valley, represented by artists Nina Borgia-Aberle and Stephen Grede, requests conceptual approval of a public art proposal for the Lambert Lane Widening Project, located in various locations along the roadway east of Riverfront Park and west of the CDO Wash. For questions and additional information, please contact Matt Michels, Senior Planner, at \(520\) 820-0549 or \[mmichels@orovalleyaz.gov\]\(mailto:mmichels@orovalleyaz.gov\)](#)

[Staff report](#)

[Applicant packet](#)

David Ronquillo, OV Senior Planner, reviewed the following:

- Jose Rodriguez, OV Engineer Division Manager, as the Project Manager
- Location site
- Staff approval

Chairman Moutafis asked what the dollar amount of the original contract was. Mr.

Ronquillo said he did not know and handed the question over to the applicants. Nina Borgia-Aberle, of La Ceramica, LLC, said they were awarded the Pusch View Extension Bridge and Lambert Lane Widening Projects as a combined project, and her recollection was approximately \$140,000-\$150,000.

Chairman Moutafis asked what amount was spent on the Pusch View Extension Bridge Project. Ms. Borgia-Aberle said approximately \$86,000 was spent on the railing, ramada, form liner and median.

Chairman Moutafis said this proposal is more extensive, and asked if they were using the added monies to make their scope a little bigger.

Ms. Borgia-Aberle said no and explained that the proposals are similar with the exception of the large Garambullo.

Ms. Borgia-Aberle and Stephen Grede, of Robert Bailey & Stephen Grede, Inc., presented the following:

- Previous art projects
- Extension bridge proposed art

Ms. Borgia-Aberle said the theme was inspired by the garambullos and devil claws they found growing in the wash. Ms. Borgia-Aberle and Mr. Grede found them to be beautiful sculpture forms and would be a great inspiration as a design element.

Presentation resumed as follows:

- Pusch View pedestrian railing and form liner
- Pusch View bridge, median and paving pattern, Garambullo
- Botanical drawings
- Garambullo seat wall elevation

Commissioner Hagedorn asked why CMU masonry was being used.

Mr. Grede said CMU masonry is easier to patch and paint.

Vice Chair Cywan said he was concerned with tagging and asked how easily it can be cleaned.

Ms. Borgia-Aberle said the seat wall can be repainted and an anti-graffiti solution would be used for the tile.

Commissioner Hagedorn asked if there would be a pattern in the yellow tile. Ms. Borgia-Aberle said yes. Chairman Moutafis asked if she had the tile work design in her presentation. Mr. Grede showed them a preliminary tile work drawing from 2004. Ms. Borgia-Aberle said the colors are switched from the 2004 drawing.

Ms. Borgia-Aberle and Mr. Grede resumed their presentation on the location of the Garambullo seat bench.

Discussion took place regarding a future bus shelter in that area.

Commissioner Hagedorn asked Mr. Ronquillo if all artwork for road projects are reviewed by the commission. Mr. Ronquillo responded in the affirmative.

Ms. Borgia-Aberle and Mr. Grede continued their presentation regarding the lighting on the Garambullo.

Chairman Moutafis asked if there were any questions of the commission specific to this project.

Ms. Borgia-Aberle said she was not finished with the presentation and continued with the placement of the Garambullos and pedestrian rail.

Vice Chair Cywan asked what colors would be used. Ms. Borgia-Aberle said the green would be the same, but the cross section of the flower would be pale lavender.

Mr. Grede continued his presentation on the retaining wall form liner.

Chairman Moutafis said no one knows that plant and as artists, we understand the visual, but the community will not. Chairman Moutafis said the plant is lost between the two bars and he does not feel comfortable having it throughout Lambert Lane. Chairman Moutafis said the bronze part on top of the bench looks like a peanut and it is very important on how it communicates to the community. Chairman Moutafis said Lambert Lane does not end at La Canada; it ends at La Cholla and would be offended if all the money is spent between La Canada and Pusch View Bridge. Ms. Borgia-Aberle asked Chairman Moutafis if he had ever looked at a cholla or prickly pear bud and said that is what it will look like. Chairman Moutafis said he would like to see that detail before he says it is a go.

Commissioner Hagedorn asked if the project extends to La Cholla. Ms. Borgia-Aberle said no. Commissioner Hagedorn said he assumes that La Canada to La Cholla would be widened at a later date under a different project. Chairman Moutafis said the street between First Avenue and the bridge have many wonderful homes and asked why they are not getting any attention. Chairman Moutafis said he would take that up with Jose Rodriguez.

Commissioner Hagedorn said the object form is up to the interpretation of the artist. Commissioner Hagedorn said the images are great and likes the continuity from La Canada to Oracle Road and it is not an issue for him. Chairman Moutafis interjected and said it is an issue for him.

Commissioner Hagedorn said his concern is the bus stops need to conform to the same colors and design themes. Chairman Moutafis interjected saying that is not the applicant's issue. Commissioner Hagedorn said he was directing his concern to Town staff.

Commissioner Hagedorn said this is just a concept review and the drawings need to reflect what you are proposing when it comes in for final approval.

Mr. Grede said the drawings are due the end of July. They were supposed to be on the agenda last month, which would have given them an opportunity to do one more review. Mr. Grede said since the drawings are due we will not be able to have another review and this is the final review.

Commissioner Hagedorn asked Mr. Ronquillo if this was a preliminary review. Ms. Borgia-Aberle said it was supposed to be that last month, but they got bumped without being told and Mr. Rodriguez should be here for this because he wants our final drawings in July.

Commissioner Hagedorn said we need to see exactly what is being proposed. Ms. Borgia-Aberle asked what was missing.

Chairman Moutafis said we are looking at a photograph from 2004 regarding the tile drawings and the packet shows tile work, but it is not for this project. Mr. Grede said the tile drawing in the packet is what was done for the Pusch View Bridge.

Mr. Grede said they could return and bring those drawings and samples to the commission, but the artwork needs to be approved. Mr. Grede said since they were bumped last month they do not have an opportunity to make.... Chairman Moutafis interjected and said we did not bump you and remember that.

Vice Chair Cywan said normal procedure is for the artist to come in with a .... Chairman Moutafis interjected and said preliminary concept. Vice Chair Cywan continued saying the first review is conceptual and then the artist returns for final review.

Ms. Borgia-Aberle asked what clarification is needed besides the more detailed drawing of the tile. Chairman Moutafis said he wants to see something close to the final product. Ms. Borgia-Aberle asked what it is Chairman Moutafis wanted. Chairman Moutafis said tell me what it is and I will tell you what I want.

Ms. Borgia-Aberle asked Chairman Moutafis; "Physically, what is it you want, a drawing, a more defined model? Chairman Moutafis said he wants them to bring them exactly what it is going to look like.

Commissioner Hagedorn wanted clarification if the drawing that was brought out is what they are proposing. Ms. Borgia-Aberle said no, they only brought out the 2004 drawing because there was a question on the tile. Commissioner Hagedorn asked for clarification on the colors.

Commissioner Munden asked the applicant to bring an actual dab of the paint that will be used.

Commissioner Hagedorn asked again the reason for the time constraint.

Mr. Grede said the roadway drawings are to be finished this month.

Commissioner Hagedorn asked if the commission was holding them up by asking them to bring that information back. Ms. Borgia-Aberle said no, but they need to know if they can put this in basic form in the locations stated.

Vice Chair Cywan said a conditional approval is an approval on the condition they come back with the requested information and possibly.... Chairman Moutafis interjected and said what good would that do them because they are going to have to come back anyway. Vice Chair Cywan said it would help them meet their deadline.

Commissioner Munden said we would be approving the concept.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Commissioner Hagedorn and seconded by Commissioner Munden to approve OV510-005, the Town of Oro Valley public art element for the Lambert Lane Widening Project as to its physical form of the Garambullo seat wall, the form liner and railing, with the condition that the applicant return with specific colors and final detail for the bronze sculptural element for the next scheduled ARC meeting.

**MOTION** carried, 3-1 with Chairman Moutafis opposed.

Commissioner Hagedorn said so that is.....  
Chairman Moutafis interjected and asked for any other motion.

Commissioner Hagedorn said it is an approval. Chairman Moutafis said it is not an approval, because it is not a majority. Commissioner Hagedorn said it is a 3-1 vote in favor. Chairman Moutafis said the commission is seven members.

Mr. Ronquillo said it is the majority of the quorum and is an approval with the conditions.

Adjournment

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Commissioner Munden and seconded by Vice Chair Cywan to adjourn the ARC meeting at 5:10 p.m.

**MOTION** carried, 4-0.

Prepared by,

---

Suzanne Molinar  
Recording Secretary