

**MINUTES**  
**ORO VALLEY ART REVIEW COMMISSION**  
**\*AMENDED AGENDA**  
**REGULAR SESSION**  
**September 7, 2010**  
**HOPI CONFERENCE ROOM**  
**11000 N. LA CAÑADA DRIVE**

Call to Order at or after 4:00 p.m.

Chairman Moutafis called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm.

**Roll Call**

**PRESENT:** Matthew Moutafis, Chairman  
Zev Cywan, Vice Chair  
Steve Hagedorn, Commissioner  
Gail Munden, Commissioner

\*5. OV509-003, Golder Ranch Fire District, represented by Matthew Moutafis, requests final approval of public art for the Golder Ranch Fire Station located at the Oracle Vista Centre, at the northwest corner of Oracle Road and Linda Vista Blvd.

For questions and additional information, please contact Matt Michels, Senior Planner, at (520) 229-4822 or [mmichels@orovalleyaz.gov](mailto:mmichels@orovalleyaz.gov)

Chairman Moutafis pulled OV509-003 and said it would be on a future agenda.

Chairman Moutafis said he would like to start the agenda with OV510-005, OV510-006, then OV510-007, and asked for a motion.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Commissioner Hagedorn and seconded by Vice Chair Cywan to agree with change in the agenda order as stated.

**MOTION** carried, 4-0.

2. OV510-005, The Town of Oro Valley, represented by artists Nina Borgia-Aberle and Stephen Grade, requests final approval of a public art proposal for the Lambert Lane widening project, located in various locations east of La Canada and west of the Pusch View Lane bridge. For questions and additional information, please contact Matt Michels, Senior Planner, at (520) 229-4822 or [mmichels@orovalleyaz.gov](mailto:mmichels@orovalleyaz.gov)

Matt Michels, OV Senior Planner, presented the following:

- Location Map
- Existing Public Art Elements
- Garambullo Sculpture & Inspiration
- Mini Garambullo Seat Wall
- Garambullo Seat Wall
- Decorative Pedestrian Railing
- Retaining Wall Form Liner

Commissioner Hagedorn asked if there were any changes on this proposal since the last presentation. Mr. Michels responded no, that it was the commission's request for the applicant to return with additional material.

Stephen Grede and Nina Borgia-Aberle, applicants and artists, presented the following:

- Model of the Garambullo Seat Wall Sculpture
- Garambullo Sculpture patina and inspiration
- Mini Grambullo Seat Wall tile sample and colors

Vice Chair Cywan asked if the sample tiles represent the colors. Ms. Borgia-Aberle said the color would be along the line of a natural green that is found in desert flora.

Mr. Grede & Ms. Borgia-Aberle continued their presentation on the Mini Garambullo Seat Wall.

Commissioner Hagedorn asked staff if there had been any vandalism in terms of skaters riding on the edge of the existing bench. Jose Rodriguez, OV Engineering Division Manager, said the Town had not received any vandalism reports.

Chairman Moutafis asked if the current pieces of art would be moved or destroyed due to the widening project. Mr. Rodriguez said they would be removed.

Mr. Grede continued the presentation on the art railing.

Ms. Borgia-Aberle said they would request the contractor to paint a sample of rail with the colors selected; then they would inspect it and approve the colors.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Vice Chair Cywan and seconded by Commissioner Munden to approve OV510-005 as submitted

**MOTION** carried, 4-0.

Commissioner Hagedorn requested a condition be added to OV510-005, that the Town be required to consult with the artists to determine deterrent if the benches are being damaged by vandalism. All commissioners were in agreement.

1. Approval of the August 3, 2010, ARC minutes.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Commissioner Munden and seconded by Commissioner Hagedorn to approve the August 3, 2010, ARC minutes.

**MOTION** carried, 4-0.

4. [OV510-006, Panda Express, represented by Santa Theresa Tile Works, requests conceptual approval of a public art proposal for the Panda Express restaurant, located in proximity to the southeast corner of Oracle Road and Magee Road. For questions and additional information, please contact David Ronquillo, Senior Planner, at \(520\) 229-4817 or \[dronquillo@orovalleyaz.gov\]\(mailto:dronquillo@orovalleyaz.gov\).](#)

David Ronquillo, OV Senior Planner, presented the following:

- Location map
- Art location
- Proposed art
- Building elevations

Chairman Moutafis was concerned with the scale of the artwork and felt it could have been larger.

Vice Chair Cywan said he liked the concept of the caricatures but not the actual shape.

Commissioner Hagedorn was concerned with the safety of the piece due to the sharp corners on the movable tiles.

Susan Gamble, artist, said the project is in the concept stage and she would provide the actual dimensions and materials to be used at the next stage.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Vice Chair Cywan and seconded by Commissioner Munden to approve OV510-006, Panda Express, request for conceptual approval of a public art proposal for the Panda Express restaurant, located in proximity to the southeast corner of Oracle Road and Magee Road.

**MOTION** carried, 4-0.

3. [OV510-007, Harvest Development LLC, requests conceptual approval of a public art proposal for the Oro Valley Retirement Residence, located at 30 West Lambert Lane. Six different art installations are proposed for six locations throughout the site. For questions and additional information, please contact Karen Berchtold, Senior Planner, at \(520\) 229-4814 or \[kberchtold@orovalleyaz.gov\]\(mailto:kberchtold@orovalleyaz.gov\)](#)

Karen Berchtold, OV Senior Planner, presented the following:

- Location Map
- Project Site
- Project Architecture
- Art Locations: Main Building (East)
- Art: Main Building
- Art Locations: Cottages (West)
- Art: Cottages
- Additional Pieces

Commissioner Munden said she would like the locations of the art to be more accessible to the public.

Chairman Moutafis asked how much was budgeted for the project. Ms. Berchtold said a total of \$138,939.

Chairman Moutafis asked how the dollar amount for each piece is determined, and where the decision came from to have six locations. Ms. Berchtold said it would be best to refer those questions to the artist.

Commissioner Munden asked if the amount over the \$100,000 could be put into the Oro Valley Art Fund. Ms. Berchtold said yes.

David Williams, OV Interim Planning Division Manager, said for clarification we are looking for approval of locations.

Paul Oland, representing The WLB Group, said the architecture and landscape plans were approved, and the development plan would go before Town Council this month. Mr. Oland explained the need to pay attention to the footers, site visibility and the constraints set by the Public Works Department. Mr. Oland said in working with Ms. Berchtold, the Lenity Group and Mr. Tyler, the six locations were determined after viewing the site.

Chairman Moutafis asked if there could be less locations. Mr. Oland responded that as far as he knew there were no code requirements.

Chairman Moutafis said he liked the cactus and the roadrunner but the art pieces so not work well for the site and there is nothing specifically designed for the site.

Joe Tyler, artist, said he was given direction from the developer to come up with a design specifically for the landscape. Mr. Tyler said a great deal of thought went into the project and presented 40 different items. Mr. Tyler said the swing and the outdoor seating were done for the site, and made for the owner.

Commissioner Hagedorn was concerned with locations of items 2 and 3 in the courtyard. Mr. Tyler said the art pieces would be at opposite ends of the large courtyard and the locations were selected by the architect and the landscape architect.

Commissioner Munden asked if any of the artwork would be visible from Lambert Lane. Mr. Tyler's response was no.

Chairman Moutafis asked what Southern Arizona Arts & Cultural Alliance's (SAACA) commission would be on this project.

Mr. Williams said it would be 5% of the final agreed upon budget.

Vice Chair Cywan asked if the development group was given a list of artists and if they were contacted. Mr. Oland said yes and that there were several artists that were interviewed.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Commissioner Hagedorn and seconded by Commissioner Munden to approve OV510-007, Harvest Development LLC,'s request for conceptual approval of a public art proposal for the Oro Valley Retirement Residence, located at 30 West Lambert Lane. Six different art installations are proposed for six locations throughout the site.

**MOTION** failed, 2-2 with Chairman Moutafis and Vice Chair Cywan opposed.

Commissioner Munden said it is not the Commission's job to tell the owner whether their taste in art is different than our taste.

Vice Chair Cywan said it is the Commission's obligation to the community to exercise a certain amount of control.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Commissioner Hagedorn to approve OV510-007 on the condition that half of the artwork is a different style and material.

Commissioner Hagedorn withdrew his motion for the lack of a second.

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Vice Chair Cywan and seconded by Commissioner Hagedorn to deny OV510-007, with the request that the artist return with another presentation.

**MOTION** carried, 3-1 with Commissioner Munden opposed.

6. Discussion regarding public art requirements and process.

Chairman Moutafis said he would like to redefine the current process so that the developer has the opportunity to discuss and talk with many artists.

Commissioner Hagedorn asked Chairman Moutafis if he was implying that SAACA not be involved in the process. Chairman Moutafis responded that they are a regional organization and have nothing to do with the Town. He said the same artists are coming in all the time.

Mr. Williams said SAACA is an organization that provides a service. Other cities and towns contract with groups like SAACA for the advertising and selection process to ensure diversity. Mr. Williams said the commission can discuss it further and look at whether SAACA or Tucson Pima Arts Council could provide this service.

Commissioner Hagedorn asked if the applicant has to go through SAACA. Chairman Moutafis said they were the only ones listed on the Town's website.

Mr. Williams asked the commissioners to each provide him with ideas on what their preferred process would be. He said staff needs direction on the process in order to carry the commission's ideas forward to Town Council for discussion and development.

Discussion among the commissioners took place regarding the three stage process, and the use of the art fund.

Chairman Moutafis said these items should be discussed in a study session as soon as possible.

Mr. Williams said he would schedule a study session and put together a draft agenda to circulate among the commissioners.

Adjournment

**MOTION:** A motion was made by Commissioner Hagedorn and seconded by Commissioner Munden to adjourn the ARC meeting at 5:52 pm.

**MOTION** carried, 4-0.

Prepared by,

---

Suzanne Molinar  
Recording Secretary