

MINUTES
ORO VALLEY PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION
May 7, 2019
ORO VALLEY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
11000 N. LA CAÑADA DRIVE

REGULAR SESSION AT OR AFTER 6:00 PM

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Swope called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT:

Bob Swope, Chair
Nathan Basken, Vice Chair
Hal Bergsma, Commissioner
Celeste Gambill, Commissioner
Thomas Gribb, Commissioner
Ellen Hong, Commissioner
Skeet Posey, Commissioner

ALSO PRESENT:

Council Liaison Bill Rodman
Chief Civil Deputy Attorney Joe Andrews
Community and Economic Development Director J.J. Johnston
Planning Manager Bayer Vella
Permitting Manager David Laws

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chair Swope led the audience and Commission in the Pledge of Allegiance.

CALL TO AUDIENCE

There were no speaker requests.

COUNCIL LIAISON COMMENTS

Council Liaison Bill Rodman provided the following updates:

- The Town Center project is on the Town Council agenda for May 15
- Council Budget Study Session is tomorrow evening (May 8) with the vote the following week (May 15)

REGULAR SESSION AGENDA

1. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE APRIL 2, 2019 REGULAR SESSION MEETING MINUTES

MOTION: A motion was made by Commissioner Bergsma and seconded by Commissioner Posey to approve the meeting minutes as written.

MOTION carried, 7-0.

2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON A REQUEST FOR CONCEPTUAL ARCHITECTURE FOR THE EXPANSION OF PUSCH RIDGE CHRISTIAN ACADEMY, INCLUDING A NEW BUILDING AND ADDITION OF A MODULAR BUILDING, LOCATED EAST OF ORACLE ROAD BETWEEN CALLE CONCORDIA AND LINDA VISTA BOULEVARD, 1900554

Planner Hannah Oden provided a presentation that included the following:

- Purpose
- Location
- Building 3 Expansion
- Building 3
- Modular Building
- Compatibility with Existing Campus Development
- Summary and Recommendation

Applicant Bruce Call, architect for the project, clarified that the screening for the downspouts will be metal, but not corrugated.

Discussion ensued among the Commission and applicant.

MOTION: A motion was made by Commissioner Gribb and seconded by Commissioner Bergsma to recommend approval of the Conceptual Architecture for the proposed Building 3 and the addition of a modular building at Pusch Ridge Christian Academy, based on the findings that the request complies with the Design Principles and Design Standards of the Zoning Code.

MOTION carried, 7-0.

3. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON A REQUEST FOR CONCEPTUAL MODEL HOME ARCHITECTURE FOR THE SAGUARO VIEJOS EAST SUBDIVISION, LOCATED NEAR THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF LA CHOLLA BOULEVARD AND NARANJA DRIVE, OV1803242

Senior Planner Milini Simms provided a presentation that included the following:

- Purpose
- Location
- Approved Site Plan
- Design Principles and Standards
- Colors and Materials
- Compatibility
- Summary and Recommendation

Applicant Jeff Grobstein with Meritage Homes, spoke about his history in working with the Town and reviewed the various model homes in greater detail: elevation enhancements, color schemes, stone selections, and the elevations per plan.

Discussion ensued among the Commission and applicant.

MOTION: A motion was made by Commissioner Posey and seconded by Commissioner Gambill to approve the Conceptual Model Home Architecture for eight (8) model homes in the Saguaros Viejos East subdivision, based on the findings that the request complies with the Design Principles and Design Standards of the Zoning Code.

MOTION carried, 7-0.

4. PUBLIC HEARING: DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A PROPOSED SELF-STORAGE AND BUSINESS CENTER, LOCATED ON THE NORTHWEST CORNER OF ORACLE ROAD AND CALLE CONCORDIA

ITEM A: PROPOSED REZONING FROM LARGE-LOT RESIDENTIAL TO TECHNOLOGICAL PARK, OV1803281

ITEM B: PROPOSED CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT FOR THE SELF-STORAGE USE, OV1803280

Senior Planner Milini Simms provided a presentation that included the following:

- Purpose
- Location
- A. Rezoning Request
- Alignment with the General Plan
- Technological Park (T-P) Zoning
- Tentative Development Plan
- B. Conditional Use Permit
- Technological Park Architectural Design
- Architectural Design
- General Plan Conformance

- Public Participation
- Key Factors
- Summary and Recommendation

Brian Underwood with The Planning Center, provided a presentation that included the following:

- Existing and Proposed Zoning
- Original Tentative Development Plan
- Viewshed Analysis - Existing
- Viewshed Analysis - Conceptual
- Setbacks, Operations and Traffic
- Original Tentative Development Plan and Reorientation
- Landscape, Screening and Open Space
- 3D Building Simulations
- Business Center and Entry Plaza

Applicant and developer Hank Amos spoke on the following topics:

- Oro Valley is severely under saturated in self-storage
- Provided a map to Commission and explained how this area was chosen
- Tech Park land and how this use is ancillary to those businesses
- The proposed storage facility will be climate controlled
- Challenges with the site, why it was chosen, and amount of land protected/preserved
- Explained business centers and how they are used

Discussion ensued among the Commission, applicant and staff.

Chair Swope opened the public hearing.

Nancy Young Wright, Oro Valley resident, spoke in opposition to agenda item 4.

Chair Swope closed the public hearing.

Further discussion continued among the Commission, applicant and staff.

MOTION: A motion was made by Commissioner Gambill and seconded by Commissioner Bergsma to recommend approval of the rezoning request from R1-144 to Technology Park on the northwest corner of Oracle Road and Calle Concordia, subject to the Conditions in Attachment 1, based on the finding the request complies with the Town of Oro Valley Zoning Code and General Plan.

MOTION carried, 6-1 with Commissioner Hong opposed.

MOTION: A motion was made by Chair Swope and seconded by Commissioner Gribb to recommend approval of a Conditional Use Permit for a self-storage business, subject

to the conditions in Attachment 2, based on the finding the request complies with the Town of Oro Valley Zoning Code and with the added conditions that (1) the business hours are limited to 6am-7pm, with remote/key access between 7pm-11pm and (2) additional faux windows are added to the east and west facades.

MOTION failed, 3-4 with Vice Chair Basken, Commissioner Bergsma, Commissioner Gambill, and Commissioner Posey opposed.

MOTION: A motion was made by Commissioner Gambill and seconded by Commissioner Hong to recommend denial of a Conditional Use Permit for a self-storage business based on the finding that it will not add revenue or jobs, which are key components that the Town is looking for based on the General Plan.

AMENDED MOTION: A motion was made by Commissioner Bergsma to Amend Motion to recommend denial of a Conditional Use Permit for a self-storage business based on the following findings: The proposed use is not consistent with the Town Council's recently approved Strategic Leadership Plan. Goal 1A of the plan states "Implement strategies to improve opportunities to attract, grow and retain primary employers and expand local job opportunities." The Strategic Plan was informed by a Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy recently prepared under the direction of the Town's Director of Economic and Community Development. On page 14 of that document it is noted that "Less than 200 acres of buildable primary employer land remains within the 36 square miles of Oro Valley." It is also noted, on the same page, that "The Town's primary employer land inventory is inadequate...". Yet, this application would have the town allow the development of several acres of its limited supply of employment land with a use that generates virtually no employment. The proposed use is not consistent with the purpose statement for the Technological Park (T-P) District, which states, in part, that: "This district is to provide employment near residential areas...". Although the subject property is near residential areas, virtually no employment would be provided. The applicant, who has the burden of proof for demonstrating the proposed use satisfies zoning code requirements, has not shown that the proposed use is consistent with all relevant goals and policies of the general plan, as required by Section 22.5.A.3 of the Zoning Code. Specifically, it has not been shown how the proposed conditional use supports General Plan goals and policies of growing employment opportunities and supporting a strong and diverse economy. Relevant goals and policies include: Goal A: Long-term financial and economic stability and sustainability. Goal B: A robust local economy and job market that provide opportunities for quality employment, build on Oro Valley's assets and encourage high-quality growth. Policy E.1: Develop a diversified and robust economic base to support long-term economic stability. Policy E.3: Promote Oro Valley as an ideal destination for economic activity, tourism, shopping, cultural attractions, research and development. The proposed use would do virtually nothing to generate jobs, while permanently removing the potential for the creation of jobs on the subject property. Although the applicant asserts there is a need for an additional self storage facility in Oro Valley, the fact is that a new self storage facility will soon open in Steam Pump Village that will provide about 700 additional storage units for community use, beyond those provided by several other self storage facilities in and near the town.

Additionally, the applicant has not shown how the proposed conditional use supports General Plan goals and policies that call for a balanced multi-modal transportation system to serve the community. Relevant goals and policies include: Goal R: An integrated and connected transportation network that enhances mobility for people and goods. Goal S: Diverse transportation choices that are safe, user-friendly, efficient and accessible, that maintain the lifestyle of residents, and that support employees, visitors and the local economy. Policy LU.7: Coordinate planning for land use and transportation in order to promote growth areas and transit and commercial corridors. The Town of Oro Valley has limited fixed route public transit service but weekday Sun Shuttle service is provided along Oracle Road, including a stop at the intersection of Calle Concordia and Oracle, next to the subject property. This route ties to three Sun Tran routes at the intersection of Ina and Oracle. The proposed use would not take advantage of the transit service offered at this location and support use of this route.

MOTION carried, 6-1 with Commissioner Gribb opposed.

PLANNING UPDATE (INFORMATIONAL ONLY)

Planning Manager Bayer Vella provided an update on the upcoming Planning and Zoning Commission meeting in June.

ADJOURNMENT

Chair Swope adjourned the meeting at 9:39 p.m.

Prepared by:


Jeanna Ancona
Senior Office Specialist

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and correct copy of the regular session Planning and Zoning Commission meeting of Oro Valley, Arizona held on the 7th day of May, 2019. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.